What is A Constitution?

CCLGT

Introduction

- What "Constitutes" A Constitution? (Past, Present, Future?)
 - Functions, Concept, Form and Content

 How Constitutional Frameworks Develop (US, UK, FR, DE, CEE)

What "Constitutes" A Constitution?

- Constitute (verb) = "to be part of something bigger"
 - Regulate ONE specific segment of international legal order

- What ONE specific segment? Cf. What is a State? (Territory, Population, Public Power – Political Will)
- How to "Constitute" A Constitution?
 - Existing Institutions and Procedures

What "Constitution"? (Historical)

Historical (Unwritten) - Uncodified

- Organic legal development over 100s of years
- E.g. UK
- Unspecified number of laws constitute the body of the constitution – all special for different reasons

Chartered (Written) – Codified

 Adopted through special procedures, by special institutions (created for this purpose) – ceremonial (charter)

One specific document?

What "Constitution"? (Theoretical)

Procedural Constitution

- Defines structures
- Sets limits of power
- Protects democratic processes and human rights

• Prescriptive Constitution

- Fundamental function: charter of 'state identity' – goals and values
- Strong emphasis on social content and "ideological" legal and political content

What "Constitution"?

- "A rose by any other **name** would smell as sweet" (?)
- Not only states, international organizations also have constitutions
 - ILO, IOM

- Some states have Basic Laws, Fundamental Laws
- Function matters: create rights and obligations + creates institutions
 that have powers to change, protect and enforce the constitution

Why Compare?

• Putting the 'Comparative' in Comparative Constitutional Law is necessary for a contextual understanding of legal institutions in law and politics.

• Learning differences and similarities of the different Forms of Government helps understand basic legal and political structures operating in a State (as a framework of exercising public power over the population within the sovereign territory)

• Lessons of a comparison can be important inputs into interstate and international relations (convergence of problems and solutions)

Why Compare?

- Different cultural and historical traditions, circumstances are meant to be understood (*cultural relativism*) in any comparison
- "Cross-fertilization" ideas and models of different institutions need to be observed (patterns of development) to thoroughly improve domestic legal and political cultures and institutional frameworks
- CCL serves **legal and institutional capacity-building** (e.g. ENP finances institutional development in EU candidate countries work usu. based on international models and patterns) **legal competitiveness**

"Constituting" the Boundaries of the Political Community

In Geographical Terms

- Borders
- Territorial Integrity
- Territorial/Administrative
 Structure
- Territorial Claims

In Personal Terms

- Members of the Political Community
- Citizens
- Other groups

"Constituting" Limits of Sovereignty

• **Self-imposed limitations** on the exercise of sovereign powers:

• By the **constitution** (separation of powers, checks and balances, etc.)

By national laws (governing rights and obligations)

 By national legal institutions (guaranteeing rights and administering/overseeing procedures)

"Constituting" Identity

- Preambles or Foundations general historical, cultural, etc. narrative,
- "messages",
- value judgments and evocation of certain principles

- Identity Symbols of Sovereignty
- Emphasis on Religion / Language / Culture
- Declarations and Commitments

"Constituting" Authority (cf. Sovereignty)

 Holders: Form of Government (representative of sovereignty) + source of power?

- Representative: Head of State (normally)
- Source: People

• Powers:

 Exercise of sovereign powers through direct OR indirect democratic means

- Parliamentary representation OR
- Popular vote / Referendum

"Constituting" Constitution-Making Authority

Direct + Indirect Democracy

- Legislation and constitutionmaking in one hand
- Special majorities for special procedures
- Optional: referendum before or after

 Separate Organ Created (through Constitution/Legislation)

- Dies with the adoption of the Constitution
- Convention (Philadelphia, France, etc.)

"Constituting" Power and Institutions

 Checks and Balances of the Three Branches of Power Church and State – "Religious Identity" (Pluralism)

• Institutions, Processes

 Separation or Cooperation (if yes, for what purpose)

 Power-sharing: geographically / culturally defined

• Secularism?

Doctrines and Principles

 Separation and Distribution of Powers (Across all branches (Legislative, Executive and Judiciary; horizontal OR vertical) -USA

 Fusion of Powers (Legislative and Executive) – delimitation blurs – for reasons of expedient and effective governance (term and structure of these powers is connected) – EUROPE (mostly)

"Constituting" Rights

First
Generation
- Liberty

Second Generation - Equality Third
Generation
- Fraternity

A Typical Constitution? Content

Preamble + Preliminaries (Foundations)

Rights and Obligations

- Branches of Power (Institutions)
 - incl. specialized organs (e.g. Court of Auditors, ombudsmen)
 - Subnational governance
- Armed Forces (Emergency Situations, Martial Law)
 - Miscellaneous (closing, temporary, amendment, etc.)

Questions for Self-Check

- 1. How are the constitutions of states and international organizations different?
- 2. In terms of legal competitiveness, what is the added value of Comparative Constitutional Law for institutional capacity-building?
- 3. How does a constitution constitute the boundaries of the political community?
- 4. In terms of sovereign power, what sort of self-imposed limitations we know of?

Questions for Self-Check

- 5. What is the difference between direct and indirect exercise of power (under popular sovereignty)?
- 6. What kinds of rights are included in constitutions (generally)?
- 7. How could you define the principle of fusion of powers in Europe?
- 8. What is the difference between the separation and the distribution of powers?

Questions for Self-Check

- 9. How are prescriptive and procedural constitutions different?
- 10. Can the two types of constitutions overlap in a constitutional text?
- 11. What are the typical elements of the so-called 'preliminaries'. How are these different from preambles?
- 12. In which part of the constitution would you place a reference to the form of government?

Resources

- Elliot Bulmer: What Is a Constution? (IDEA Handbook)
- Mark Tushnet: Advanced Introduction into Comparative Constitutional Law, Elgar, 2014, 10-40.

• **Reading Item** 1. The Concept, Types, Functions and Content of a Constitution

This teaching material has been made at the University of Szeged, and supported by the European Union.

Project identity number: EFOP-3.4.3-16-2016-00014





European Union European Social Fund



INVESTING IN YOUR FUTURE